

Avodah Zarah – Simanim

פרק ג – כל הצלמים

דף מח – Daf 48

1. המשתחוה לאילן תוספתיה אסורה

The next Mishnah lists three types of (1) *אשירה*: if one planted it initially for idolatry, it is forbidden. (2) *אשירה* – *he pruned or trimmed* [the tree], intending the future growths to be for idolatry, he removes the new growths, and it is permitted. (3) If he set up an idol underneath, he removes the idol and the tree is permitted. Shmuel said: *המשתחוה לאילן תוספתיה אסורה* – if one bows down to a tree, its additional growth (after the bowing) is forbidden, but not the tree itself. Rebbe Elazar asked that the Mishnah implies that only pruning or trimming prohibits new growths, not bowing alone!? The Gemara answers that the Mishnah is the Rabbonon, who hold worshipping a previously planted tree does not prohibit it, and Shmuel holds like Rebbe Yose bar Yehudah who says it does. Rav Ashi objects that perhaps they argued only about prohibiting the tree itself, but everyone would agree with Shmuel that merely bowing prohibits new growths.

2. Passing under the shade of an *אשירה* or an *אשירה* itself (*tumah*)

A Mishnah states: *לא ישב בצילה* – one may not sit in the shade of [an *אשירה*], but if he did, he remains *tahor*. *ואם עבר טמא* – and if he did, he is *tamei*. The Gemara explains that there is surely a *תקרבת עבודת כוכבים* – idolatrous offering buried underneath, and this Tanna holds such items are *metamei* with *אהל* (in this case, the tree). The Mishnah concludes: *היתה גוזלת את הרבים* – if [the *אשירה*] is stealing from the public, because its branches hang over a public walkway, *ועבר תחתיה* – and one passed under it, he remains *tahor*. The *tumah* is *מדרבנן*, and does not apply where it disrupts a public thoroughfare. The Gemara asks if it is permitted to walk under the tree in this case, or if it is only not *metamei* one who did. It concludes that *דאיכא דירכא אחרינא* – where there is an alternate route, he may not pass under the *אשירה* even in a public walkway (but remains *tahor* if he did), but if there is no alternate route, it is permitted to walk under an *אשירה* which hangs over a public walkway.

3. *זה וזה גורם* (leaves of *אשרה*)

The next Mishnah permits planting vegetables under an *אשירה* during the winter, when its shade harms the plants, but not during the summer, when the shade benefits them. Rebbe Yose prohibits planting even during the winter, *מפני שהנביה נושרת עליהן* – because the leaves fall on them and fertilizes them. The Gemara asks if Rebbe Yose holds *זה וזה גורם אסור* – where this [forbidden component] (e.g., the shade) and that [permitted component] (e.g., the soil) cause a result, the product is forbidden, and the Rabbonon hold *זה וזה גורם מותר*. This contradicts their *machlokes* on Daf 43b, where Rebbe Yose rules to grind an idol and throw the powder into the wind, and the Rabbonon are concerned it may fertilize someone's plants!? The Gemara answers to reverse their opinions in our Mishnah. Alternatively, the Rabbonon in our Mishnah hold *מה שמשיב בנביה פוגם בצל* – what [the *אשירה*] improves with its leaves, it damages with its shade, so the sum total is not beneficial. The Gemara also suggested an answer for the contradiction in Rebbe Yose, but eventually proves on the next Daf that he always holds *גורם מותר*, even regarding *עבודה זרה*. It will explain that Rebbe Yose in our Mishnah was speaking according to the Rabbonon's opinion.

Siman – Brainiac

The Brainiac trying to determine the statistical chances that the *אשרה* tree had been planted originally for *avodah zarah* versus only being pruned and trimmed for future growths to be worshiped, informed a man passing under it that he was *tamei*, while another Brainiac told a farmer to come back to plant under the tree in the winter when the benefit from the leaves is cancelled due to the harm from the shade.



The Brainiac trying to determine the statistical chances that the אשרה tree had been planted originally for avodah zarah versus only being pruned and trimmed for future growths to be worshipped, informed a man passing under it that he was tamei, while another Brainiac told a farmer to come back to plant under the tree in the winter when the benefit from the leaves is cancelled due to the harm from the shade.

3 things to remember

1. המשתחוה לאילן תוספתיה אסורה
2. Passing under the shade of an אשרה or an אשרה itself (tumah)
3. (אשרה) זה זה גורם

